

Global stability of a commensal- host ecological model with limited resources and both are harvesting at a constant rate

N. Phani Kumar

Faculty in Mathematics, Departmental Humanities & Sciences, Malla Reddy Engineering College, Secunderabad, India

Abstract

In this paper we establish the global stability of a commensalism-host ecological model surviving with limited resources and both are harvesting at a constant rate, by constructing a suitable Liapunov's function in case of co-existent equilibrium state. AMD Classification: 92D25, 92D40.

Keywords: Equilibrium state, Liapunov's function, Global stability.

INTRODUCTION

The present investigation is mainly devoted to establish the global stability of the co-existent equilibrium state of the commensal-host model by employing a properly constructed Liapunov's function.

Phani Kumar and N.Ch.Pattabhi Ramacharyulu etc. [9] examined the local stability of a commensal -host ecological model surviving with limited resources and both are harvesting at a constant rate, on the quasi-linear basic balancing equations. The present authors has been also discussed the local stability analysis for a host-commensal eco-system in their earlier work [6, 7, 8, 11].

LIAPUNOV'S STABILITY ANALYSIS

Many approaches are available for the stability analysis of linear,time-invarient systems. However for non-linear systems and/or time-varying systems, stability analysis may be extremely difficult or impossible. Liapunov Stability analysis is one method that may be applied for non-linear systems. In 1892 A.M. Liapunov introduced the direct method to study the global stability of equilibrium states in case of linear and non-linear systems. His method is based on the chief characteristic of constructing a scalar function called Liapunov's function. That is by using the direct method of Liapunov,we can determine the stability of a system without solving the state. This is quite advantageous because solving non-linear and/or time-invarying state equation is very difficult. To day this method is widely recognized as an efficient tool in theory of control systems, dynamical systems, systems with time lag, power system analysis, and time varying non-linear feed back systems, multi species ecological systems and so on.

The stability behavior of solutions of linear and weakly nonlinear system is done by using the techniques of variation of constants formulae and integral inequalities. So this analysis is confined to a small neighborhood of operating point i.e., local stability.

Received: Dec 10, 2011; Revised: Jan 18, 2012; Accepted: Feb 15, 2012.

*Corresponding Author

N. Phani Kumar

Faculty in Mathematics, Departmental Humanities & Sciences, Malla Reddy Engineering College, Secunderabad, India

Tel: +91-9866102086

Email: phanikumar_nandanaranam@yahoo.com

Further, the techniques used there in require explicit knowledge of solutions of corresponding linear systems. The stability behavior of a physical system is discussed by several authors like Kapoor [2], Lotka [3], Ogata [4] Bhaskara Rama Sarma and N.Ch.PattabhiRamacharyulu [1], Lakshminarayan and N.Ch.PattabhiRamacharyulu [5], Phanikumar and N.Ch .Pattabhi Ramacharyulu [10]etc

If the total energy of a physical system has a local minimum at a certain equilibrium point, then that point is stable. This idea was generalized by Liapunov to study stability problems in a broader context.

STABILITY BY LIAPUNOV'S DIRECT METHOD

Consider an autonomous system

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = F(x, y)$$

$$\frac{dy}{dt} = G(x, y)$$
(1)

Assume that this system has an isolated critical point taken as (0, 0). Consider a function E(x, y) possessing continuous partial derivatives along the path of (1). This path is represented by C = [(x(t), y(t)]] in the parametric form. E(x, y) can be regarded as a function of 't' along C with rate of change

$$\frac{dE}{dt} = \frac{\partial E}{\partial x} \frac{dx}{dt} + \frac{\partial E}{\partial y} \frac{dy}{dt}$$

$$\frac{dE}{dt} = \frac{\partial E}{\partial x} F(x, y) + \frac{\partial E}{\partial y} G(x, y)$$
(2)

BASIC EQUATIONS OF THE MODEL

The basic equations for the growth rate of a flourishing commensal and host species with limited resources are given by

$$\frac{dN_{1}}{dt} = a_{1}N_{1} - a_{11}N_{1}^{2} + a_{12}N_{1}N_{2} - a_{11}H_{1}$$

$$\frac{dN_{2}}{dt} = a_{2}N_{2} - a_{22}N_{2}^{2} - a_{22}H_{2}$$
(3)

THE EQULIBRIUM STATES

The system (3) under investigation has nine equilibrium states given by $\frac{dN}{dt}$ =0 and these are classified into two categories A and B.

When the harvesting rates are interdependent

$$\mathbf{When} \ \ \frac{H_{1} < \frac{1}{4} \left[K_{1} + C \left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right)^{2} \right]; H_{2} < \frac{K_{2}^{2}}{4}}{K_{1} + C \left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right) \right] - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right)}; \quad \overline{N_{2}} = K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}$$

$$\mathbf{E_{2}} : \quad \overline{N_{1}} = \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right)}; \quad \overline{N_{2}} = K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}$$

The above two states exists only when

$$K_2^2 > H_2$$
 and $\left[K_1 + C \left(K_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2} \right) \right]^2 > H_1$

When the harvesting rates are not interdependent

(B.1) When
$$H_1 > \frac{1}{4} \left[K_1 + \frac{3CK_2}{4} \right]^2$$
; $H_2 < \frac{{K_2}^2}{4}$

E₃:
$$\overline{N_1} = \frac{K_1 + C\left(K_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2}\right)}{2}$$
; $\overline{N_2} = K_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2}$,

this would exists only when $K_2^2 > H_2$

(B.2) When
$$H_1 < \frac{1}{4} \left[K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{4} \right]^2 ; H_2 < \frac{K_2^2}{4}$$

$$\mathbf{E_4} : \overline{N_1} = \left(K_1 + \frac{CH_2}{K_2}\right) - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + \frac{CH_2}{K_2}}; \overline{N_2} = \frac{H_2}{K_2}$$

this would exists only when $\ \left(K_1 + \frac{CH_2}{K_2}\right)^2 > H_1$

$$\mathbf{E_5}: \ \overline{N_1} = \frac{H_1}{K_1 + \frac{CH_2}{K_2}} \ ; \ \overline{N_2} = \frac{H_2}{K_2}$$

$$\mathbf{E_6}: \overline{N_1} = \frac{K_1 + \frac{CH_2}{K_2}}{2} ; \overline{N_2} = \frac{H_2}{K_2}$$

(B.3) When
$$H_1 < \frac{1}{4} \left[K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2} \right]^2$$
; $H_2 = \frac{K_2^2}{4}$

$$E_7: \overline{N_1} = \left(K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2}\right) - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2}} ; \overline{N_2} = \frac{K_2}{2}$$

this would exists $\;\;$ only when $\;\left(K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2}\right)^2 > H_1$

$$\mathbf{E_8} : \overline{N_1} = \frac{H_1}{K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2}}; \quad \overline{N_2} = \frac{K_2}{2}$$

(B.4)When
$$H_1 = \frac{1}{4} \left[K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2} \right]^2 ; H_2 = \frac{K_2^2}{4}$$

$$E_9: \overline{N_1} = \frac{1}{2} \left[K_1 + \frac{CK_2}{2} \right]; \overline{N_2} = \frac{K_2}{2}$$

where

 $\text{Ki=} \ \frac{a_i}{a_{ii}}, \ \ \text{i=1,2 are the carrying capacities of N}_{i}.$

 $C = \frac{a_{12}}{a_{11}}$ Commensal coefficient

 $h_1 = a_{11} H_1$ is rate of harvest of the commensal

 $h_2 = a_{22} H_2$ is rate of harvest of the host.

LOCAL STABILITY ANALYSIS

The present authors [9] discussed the local stability of the above nine equilibrium states. From which the equilibrium point

$$\mathbf{E}_{1}: \overline{N_{1}} = \left(K_{1} + C\left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)\right) - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\left(K_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)};$$

 $\overline{N_2} = K_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2}$ is stable and rest of them are unstable

LIAPUNOV'S FUNCTION FOR GLOBAL STABILITY

The linearized perturbed equations over the perturbations (u_1 , u_2) of the system (3) are

$$\frac{du_{1}}{dt} = -a_{11} \left(\overline{N_{1}} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N_{2}}} \right) u_{1} + Ca_{11}\overline{N_{1}}u_{2}$$
 (4)

$$\frac{du_2}{dt} = -a_{22} \left(\overline{N_2} - \frac{H_2}{K_2} \right) u_2 \tag{5}$$

The characteristic equation is

$$\left(\lambda + a_{11} \left(\overline{N_1} - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C\overline{N_2}}\right)\right) \left(\lambda + a_{22} \left(\overline{N_2} - \frac{H_2}{K_2}\right)\right) = 0$$
 i.e.,
$$\lambda^2 + \left[a_{22} \left(\overline{N_2} - \frac{H_2}{K_2}\right) + a_{11} \left(\overline{N_1} - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C\overline{N_2}}\right)\right] \lambda + a_{22} a_{11} \left(\overline{N_1} - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C\overline{N_2}}\right) \left(\overline{N_2} - \frac{H_2}{K_2}\right) = 0$$
 (6)

equation (6) is in the form of $\lambda^2 + p\lambda + q = 0$

$$p = a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2} \right) + a_{11} \left(\overline{N}_1 - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C \overline{N}_2} \right)$$
 (7)

$$q = a_{22}a_{11} \left(\overline{N}_1 - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C\overline{N}_2} \right) \left(\overline{N}_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2} \right)$$
 (8)

By using

$$\left[a_{2}\left(\overline{N_{2}} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right) + a_{1}\left(\overline{N_{1}} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N_{2}}}\right)^{2} > 4a_{2}a_{1}\left(\overline{N_{1}} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N_{2}}}\right)\left(\overline{N_{2}} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)^{2}\right]$$

· Liapunov's conditions are satisfied

Define E $(u_1, u_2) = \frac{1}{2} (au_1^2 + 2b u_1u_2 + cu_2^2)$

Where
$$a = \frac{a_{22}^{2} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)^{2} + a_{11}a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right) \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N_{2}}}\right)}{D}$$
 (9)

$$b = \frac{Ca_{11}a_{22}\overline{N_1}\left(\overline{N_2} - \frac{H_2}{K_2}\right)}{D}$$
 (10)

$$c = \frac{a_{11}^{2} \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N}_{2}}\right)^{2} + C^{2} a_{11}^{2} \overline{N}_{1}^{2} + a_{11} a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right) \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C\overline{N}_{2}}\right)}{D}$$
(11)

$$D = pq = \left[a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right) + a_{11} \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \overline{N_{2}}} \right) \right] a_{22} a_{1} \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \overline{N_{2}}} \right) \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right) \right]$$
(12)

 D^2 (ac-b²) =

$$D^{3} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} a_{12}^{-3} \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1}} \right)^{3} + a_{11} a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{1}} \right) \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \overline{N_{2}}} \right) \\ D \end{pmatrix} \right\} \\ - \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} a_{11}^{-3} \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \overline{N_{2}}} \right)^{3} + C^{2} a_{11}^{-3} \overline{N_{1}}^{2} + a_{11} a_{22} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right) \left(\overline{N}_{1} - \frac{H_{1}}{K_{1} + C \overline{N_{2}}} \right) \\ D \end{pmatrix} \right\} \\ - \left(\frac{C a_{11} a_{21} \overline{N_{1}} \left(\overline{N}_{2} - \frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}} \right)}{D} \right)^{3}$$

$$\Rightarrow$$
 D²(ac - b²)> 0 i.e., b²-ac < 0 (13)

 \therefore The function E (u_1, u_2) is positive definite.

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} \frac{du_1}{dt} + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} \frac{du_2}{dt} =$$

$$\left(au_{1}+bu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{11}\left(\overline{N_{1}}-\frac{H_{1}}{K_{1}+C\overline{N_{2}}}\right)u_{1}+Ca_{11}\overline{N_{1}}u_{2}\right)+\left(bu_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+bu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-a_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-au_{2}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)u_{2}\right)+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)\left(-au_{2}\right)\left(-au_{2}\right)\left(-au_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2}\right)u_{2}+\left(au_{1}+cu_{2$$

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} \frac{du_1}{dt} + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} \frac{du_2}{dt} =$$

$$\left(aCa_{11}\overline{N_{1}}-ba_{11}\left(\overline{N_{1}}-\frac{H_{1}}{K_{1}+C\overline{N_{2}}}\right)-ba_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)\right)u_{1}u_{2}+\left(bCa_{11}\overline{N_{1}}-ca_{22}\left(\overline{N_{2}}-\frac{H_{2}}{K_{2}}\right)\right)u_{2}^{2} \ \, (14)$$

Substituting the values of a, band c from (9), (10) and (11) in (14) we get

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} \frac{du_1}{dt} + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} \frac{du_2}{dt} = -\left(\frac{D}{D} u_1^2 + \frac{D}{D} u_2^2\right)$$

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} \frac{du_1}{dt} + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} \frac{du_2}{dt} = -\left(u_1^2 + u_2^2\right)$$
(15)

which is clearly negative definite

E (u₁, u₂) is Liapunov function for the linear system.

Now we prove that E (u₁, u₂) is also a Liapunov function for the non-linear system

Define F (N₁, N₂) =
$$a_1N_1 - a_{11}N_1^2 + a_{12}N_1N_2 - a_{11}H_1$$
 (16)

$$G(N_1, N_2) = a_2 N_2 - a_{22} N_2^2 - a_{22} H_2$$
(17)

By putting N₁ =
$$\overline{N}_1$$
 + u_1 and N₂ = \overline{N}_2 + u_2 in (4) and (5)

$$F(u_1, u_2) = \frac{du_1}{dt} = -a_{11} \left[\overline{N}_1 - \frac{H_1}{K_1 + C\overline{N}_2} \right] u_1 +$$

$$C a_{11} \overline{N_1} u_2 u_2 + f(u_1, u_2)$$

G (u₁, u₂) =
$$\frac{du_2}{dt}$$
 = -a₂₂ $\left[\overline{N}_2 - \frac{H_2}{K_2} \right]$ u₂ + g (u₁, u₂)

Where

$$f(u_1, u_2) = -a_{11}u_1^2 + a_{12}u_1u_2$$

 $g(u_1, u_2) = -a_{22}u_2^2$

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} F + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} G = -(u_1^2 + u_2^2) + (\alpha u_1 + b u_2) f(u_1, u_2) + (b u_1 + c u_2) g(u_1, u_2)$$
(18)

By introducing polar co-ordinates.

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1} F + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2} G = -r^2 + r[(a\cos\theta + b\sin\theta)f(u_1, u_2) + (b\cos\theta + c\sin\theta)g(u_1, u_2)]$$
(19)

Let us denote largest of the numbers | a|, |b|, |c| by K, our assumptions imply that

52 N. Phani Kumar

 $|f(u_1, u_2)| < \frac{r}{6K}$ and $|g(u_1, u_2)| < \frac{r}{6K}$, for all satisfying small r > 0.

$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1}$$
F+ $\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2}$ G<- r^2 + $\frac{4Kr^2}{6K}$ = $\frac{r^2}{3}$ <0

Thus E (u₁, u₂) is a positive definite function with the property that

 $\frac{\partial E}{\partial u_1}F + \frac{\partial E}{\partial u_2}G$ is negative definite.

The equilibrium point is asymptotically stable.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The author is Thankful to Prof. N. Ch. Pattabhi Ramacharyulu , Professor (Retd.) of Mathematics, National Institute of Technology, Warangal, India for his guidance and constructive suggestions.

REFERENCES

- [1] Bhaskara Rama Sarma B., N.Ch. Pattabhiramacharyulu. 2008. "On Global Stability of Two-species competing Eco-system with decay and Replenishment for one of the species", International Journal of Scientific computing Vol 2 (2), PP 177-
- [2] Kapur J.N. 1985. Mathematical Modelling, Wiley Eser.
- [3] Lotka A.J. 1925. Elements of Physical Biology, Williams and willians, Baltimore.

- [4] Ogata.K. 2000. Modern Control Engineering, Prentice-Hall India.
- [5] Lakshmi Narayan K. 2005. "A Mathematical study of a prey predator Ecological Model with a partial cover for the prey and alternative food for the predator, Ph.D. Thesis, JNTU.
- [6] Phanikumar N. Seshagiri Rao. N & Pattabhi Ramacharyulu N.Ch. 2009. "On the stability of a host - A flourishing commensal species pair with limited resources". International journal of logic based intelligent systems, 3(1): 45-54
- [7] PhanikumarN., Pattabhiramacharyulu N.Ch. 2010. "A three species eco-system consisting of a prey predator and host commensal to the prey" International journal of open problems compt.math, 3(1):92-113
- [8] Phanikumar N., N.Ch.Pattabhiramacharyulu" on a Commensal Host Ecological Model with variable commensal co-efficient" Communicated to Jordan Journal of Mathematics and Statistics.
- [9] Phanikumar N., N.Ch.Pattabhiramacharvulu", on a Commensal-Host Harvested species pair with limited" Communicated to International journal of computational cognition
- [10] Phanikumar N., N.Ch.Pattabhiramacharyulu"On global stability of a host-flourishing commensal species pair with limited resources". Communicated to International journal of computational cognition
- [11] Seshagiri Rao, N., Phanikumar.N, N.Ch. Pattabhiramacharyulu. 2009. "On the stability of a Host - A declining Commensal Special pair with Limited resources", International Journal of logic based intelligent systems, Vol 3 No.1